Indexes reviewed
Edited by Christine Shuttleworth

These extracts from reviews do not pretend to represent a complete survey of all reviews in journals and newspapers. We offer only a selection from quotations that members have sent in. Our reproduction of comments is not a stamp of approval from the Society of Indexers upon the reviewer’s assessment of an index.

Extracts are arranged alphabetically under the names of publishers, within the sections: Indexes praised; Two cheers! Indexes censured; Indexes omitted; Obiter dicta.

Indexes praised


The subject index is a comprehensive A-to-Z listing. Each selected entry shows a corresponding ‘results’ column that lists all relevant articles, along with their identifying icons.


Moreover the book is meticulously edited, accurately indexed and is supplemented by a comprehensive bibliography. (Editing and indexing by AusSI member Simon Cauchi.)


The back matter of the book consists of five useful appendices, an excellent glossary, and a three-level index. . . . The authors and editors are to be commended for the overall usefulness and practicability of this book. [This book was given an award by the American Medical Writers Association – could the ‘back matter’ including the index have contributed at all to its success?]


Although this book is not a thorough history of medicine and the Italian universities, it is filled with data and insights hitherto unavailable in one volume. It also has a decent index and not just a word list. It represents a respectable body of work by one of our best and most careful scholars.


... the volume itself has been supplied with an intelligent, succinct, but thorough index that increases the value of this book a hundredfold. [That’s what we like to hear.]


I ought to add that the author is a very old friend. But there’s no reciprocal civility in pointing out how enjoyable the index is. The entry for the letter ‘O’ runs in its entirety: ‘O’Brien, Edna, 362; Observer (newspaper), 244; Olivier (boatman), 23–4; Olivier, Laurence (later Baron), 294; O’Neill, Con, 172; O’Neill, Eugene, Mourning Becomes Electra, 196; Orion (magazine), RL and Day Lewis edit, 240–2, 304; Osbourne (abortionist), 76; Oxford University: life at, 48. Who needs Miss Wade’s tabloids? All Human Life Is There.


Technically the [Foreign Relations and All-German Affairs Committee] volumes have been crafted with the care and attention to optimal utility for scholars that we have become accustomed to in the previous Quellen zur Geschichte des Parlamentarismus und der politischen Parteien, published by the Kommission für Geschichte des Parlamentarismus und der politischen Parteien e. V. in Bonn. They are generously and meticulously equipped with finding aids, source indications, and cross references. There are short biographies of all committee members; lists of meetings attended and relevant statutes and treaties; a bibliography of a very complete range of sources cited; and indexes of all persons mentioned with dates and positions as well as a well-organized subject index with cross references. The documents themselves are richly annotated with factual background and cross references. They are a joy to use.


... the book contains an enormous amount of data within a single volume and the comprehensive index does make this information accessible. [Cherry Lavell is an SI member.]


His book is the high-art critical-bio version of Daddy, Dearest, but it’s Daddy, Dearest all the same, and the English-language audience for poetry has been snapping it up like some sort of hardcover tabloid, clucking their tongues with condescending pleasure over just how bad the Old Man really was. Nugget-diggers will find the excellent index invaluable, especially, under ‘Larkin, Philip Arthur’ (1922–1985), the subheadings SEX (‘attitude to women . . . complains about expense . . . sexual log books . . . pornography’) and ATTITUDES AND OPINIONS (‘dislike of children . . . fear of marriage . . . loathing of abroad . . . right-wing politics . . . racism’). It’s a map to what Tom Paulin, the British press’s foreman nugget-digger, calls ‘the sewer under the national monument Larkin became.’


It is often difficult to find a particular website within a book of internet resources: here, the index resolves this problem by listing each website under either the name of the parent body or the disease.


The index is good. [The headline to the review reads: ‘So long, and thanks for the index.’]

Jessica Kingsley Publishers (with the National Autistic Society), Caring for a child with autism, ed. by M. Ives and N. Munro
Another quibble with this volume: to have four indexes is great, but the unfortunate selection of too large a font, resulting in it being unreadable. The usefulness of the index is somewhat compromised by the choice of its typefaces. There are references at the end of each chapter, as well as an Excel file for downloading.


There is an index of place names, but why not one of people? The index, though fully comprehensive, is not user friendly. A second index of cultivars in alphabetical order would have been an asset.

The index appears to have been totally redone for this new edition. It might be best to choose one heading and refer from another. As it is, readers might miss the information on pp. 30 and 180.

The quotable woman: the first 5,000 years


I have only two problems with the book: its inadequate index, and the way it does not go as fully as I might have liked into the collapse of the South African tour of 1968.


This is a very handsome book indeed, and much care has been taken to make it visually pleasing, with a striking embossed gold dustjacket, colour plates and plenty of black-and-white illustrations. It carries also a good deal of scholarly apparatus: some notes, a – not very thorough – index, a select bibliography, appendices dealing with speculation over Arbella’s possible inheritance of the royal malady’ phrenia, and Christopher Marlowe’s hypothetical involvement with Arbella. [What a pity to spoil the ship for a ha’porth of tar, comments Derek Copson, who sent this item.]


And on a pedantic note the index is occasionally inaccurate: you search in vain for Thackeray on page 88 but there he is on page 8, and on a pithy and contemptuous as usual.


I was disappointed not to find Aeonium in the Index. I have much admired plants of this genus growing in gardens on the Isles of Scilly and the Introduction claims to include such abnormally mild

biographical, but the information in the 58-page biographical index would be far more useful in the main entries. In this way, when readers stumble onto a wonderful quote from Pauline Kael, they would know right away that she was an award-winning film critic, or that Clare Booth Luce was a writer, feminist, politician and playwright. [So the index is too informative?]


There is an index of place names, but why not one of people?


The index appears to have been totally redone for this new edition. It has more entries and on subjects closer to our twenty-first-century hearts, including ‘buggers’, ‘contraception’, ‘sodomy’ and ‘semen’? [Triple quotes sic]. By all means add to the existing index, but I wonder why they removed so much from it. For example, the following do not appear in this new index: Arthur Davies, George Eliot, Keats, Middlemarch, The Ring, Mme de Sévigné, Osbert Sitwell, Trollope, Warboys, Wordsworth, and Yeats.

Indexes censured

The Indexer Vol. 23 No. 4 October 2003


References are set out chapter by chapter, at the end of the book, followed by a clear and simple alphabetical index. [Index by Registered Indexer Sylvia Potter.]


Memoirs to tend be short and concentrate on one period or aspect of a person’s life. This one tells all, including the tale of Howard’s colostomy (the index entry under ‘Health’ is considerable). One might not want to know quite so much, but most of it is an absorbing read.


The innovative index is in two parts: the first dealing with an a–z of problem behaviours e.g. curtains – tearing down; hair-pulling; inedible substances – eating; washing up liquid – drinking. The second part is more extensive and along more positive lines (e.g. Circles of friends; developing self-control). [Index by David Potter, AI.]


But the real showpiece of volume 20 is a 435-page comprehensive subject index that provides access to relevant volume and page numbers. [Index by Registered Indexer Ian Ross.]


Fifty years ago this year, the late Neil Ker was given official encouragement to prepare a catalogue of all the medieval manuscripts in British libraries not already covered by major published catalogues of their own. Between 1969 and 1992, four volumes of this work appeared, beginning with London and then reverting to alphabetical order from Abbotsford to York. . . But there were no indexes, and there must be many people who have read through the volumes in quest of particular authors or topics. Indeed, the indexing posed a considerable problem, so much so that it was not seriously embarked on until 1999. This volume is the result: nine indexes in all, not just of authors but also of such matters as provenances, origins and dates, secundo folios, non-Latin languages, iconography and subjects. The opportunity has also been taken to include some addenda. It is, quite simply, indispensable.


These wonderfully rich and disparate collections are well recorded in this book; well indexed and clearly laid out – ‘a must’ for any library aiming to cover modern social, political, cultural and literary history and sociology.

Two cheers!


There are references at the end of each chapter, as well as an excellent index, whose usefulness is somewhat compromised by the unfortunate selection of too large a font, resulting in it being twenty-four pages long!


Another quibble with this volume: to have four indexes is great (subject, career and occupation, ethnicity and nationality, and
places; fortunately, the omission was only from the index. [But what good is that if you can’t find it?]


One note of drama came in 1807 when Hegel fathered an illegitimate child, named Ludwig, with his landlady. Mr. Pinkard notes that after Hegel was married (in 1811) and had two other sons, he arranged for Ludwig to live with his family. It ended badly. Ludwig wished to study medicine, but Hegel refused to pay for his education. (In general, it seems that he treated Ludwig as a second-class citizen.) Ludwig broke with the family around 1826, commenting that ‘I always lived in fear but never in love of my parents.’ Mr. Pinkard deals fairly with the story of Ludwig in his text, but, curiously, there is no sign of the child in the index, either in his own right or as an episode in Hegel’s life. Under ‘Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich,’ we find entries for everything from ‘beer’ to ‘napping on sofa,’ but nothing under ‘illegitimate child’ or ‘Ludwig.’ A very Hegelian sense of priorities.


Less palatable is a decision, presumably taken by the publishers in the name of the elusive ‘popular’ reader, generally described as intelligent but uninformed, to allow the indexer to ape the illiteracy shown by the compilers of the telephone directory: Lorenzo de’ Medici (as though a brand name) appears not under ‘D’ or ‘M’ but under ‘L,’ and another entry for his Letters appears not even under his name but under ‘Le.’ [In a letter the following week, the author explains: ‘Lorenzo de’ Medici’s name appears in the bibliography (not the index) under L because he is first-named throughout the book.’]


. . . there are no entries for places or things in the index, which is hard on elderly readers with imperfect memories.


In one essay we do, inevitably, encounter the ‘Bakhtinian carnival’ and ‘Michel Foucault’s idea of a “heterotopia,”’ along with Debord, Baudrillard and Derrida. (Of these, only Bakhtin fails to appear in an index more ornamental than useful.)


The Irish reader will struggle here about the trials of the many Irish battalions which served on the peninsula, and one may consult the index in vain: for it is exactly what one has come to expect from modern publishers – an utter disgrace. The Royal Dublin Fusiliers are listed once in the index, but five times in the text – a rather niggardly tribute to a regiment which lost well over a thousand dead in Gallipoli.


And yet, this should have been a better book. It is editorially challenged, filled with long, rambling sentences and stylistic inconsistencies. . . . Boyle’s fondness for generalizing about his legalist heroes tends to flatten an understanding of their differences. Legalists often disagreed in respect to American policy. Unfortunately, their disagreements are mostly hidden in this account. Some of them, like Edwin Borchard and Quincy Wright, do not even appear in the index (an index missing sections from x to z in my copy) because their individual contributions are too often subsumed under the generic term ‘legalists.’


One would hope that the publishers decide to introduce sub-headings within chapters or increase the indexing in future editions to make the text more accessible. [The author is presumably not related to our Reviews Editor.]


I am surprised not to see ‘myoclonic jerk’ in the index, but you can’t have everything.


The four-page index is too skimpy for such a broad-ranging book and does not include several key figures discussed by name in the text.


(Incidentally, the index is a mess, confusing Chris Smith the government minister with Canon Chris Smith of Sheffield Cathedral, and also being taken up with names of people, not with ideas – as the book is.)


Within the volume there are 2327 major articles, 4000 cross-references, 20,000 bibliographical citations and 7500 index entries for persons or ships. . . . The book would perhaps have benefited from a more analytical approach in terms of geographical surveys and more flexible and extensive indexing.


. . . the single index of company names and magazine titles in [the American volume] will not help readers to access it. . . . the extensive subject index, in addition to a company index, makes [the British edition] the more helpful book.


The index . . . would serve better if it included more entries under subjective headings, instead of almost exclusively proper nouns.


There is much delightful detail . . . Shame, then, about the really feeble index.


Leadership is the first of two books that Giuliani agreed to do for a $3 million advance. The second is to be a memoir. This one gives barely a nod to messier parts of his private life, notably his bitter divorce from Donna Hanover (who is fleetingly mentioned but then denied a reference in the index).

Oxford University Press: Oxford illustrated companion to medicine, ed. by Stephen Lock, John M. Last and George Dunca (2001,
There are some apparent omissions because of poor indexing. Anthrax, for example, is not included among the As nor does it appear in the index. It is, however, to be found under Biological weapons. Nor could I find a clear account of the various types of fever. Oxford University Press: Shakespeare criticism in the twentieth century, by Michael Taylor (2001, 278 pp, £39.95). Rev. by Christopher J. Fassler, Sixteenth Century Journal 34, Spring 2003. The book indexes several references to Freud and Jung and lists Freud's collected works among its works cited, yet the same index and bibliography include no reference to Marx. The index for Taylor's book, in fact, would prove unhelpful for many of the reference purposes that readers might have. While the index logs the appearance of personal names, some literary works, and a handful of institutions (e.g. the King's Men and the Malone Society), it does not index character names (though an entire chapter examines character criticism) nor critical movements. And while the 'List of Works Cited' contains more than 550 entries, it is not a general bibliography and so it does not include such monuments as G. E. Bentley's The Profession of Dramatist in Shakespeare's Time (1913), H. M. Bradbrook's The Rise of the Common Player (1962), or Geoffrey Bullough's Narrative and Dramatic Sources of Shakespeare (1957–75). Since most anthologies of Shakespeare's works contain fairly exhaustive general bibliographies and since Taylor's project here is more narrative than bibliographical, perhaps these omissions are both understandable and forgivable. The bibliographic limitations combined with the curiously selective index do, however, greatly reduce the book's value as a reference.

Oxford University Press: Oxford textbook of endocrinology and diabetes, ed. by John A. H. Watts and Stephen M. Shalet (2002, 1952 pp, £24.5). Rev. by Gareth Williams, The Lancet, 6 Feb. 2003. Accurate indexing and cross-referencing are essential in a book of this size [and at that price!]. It is, therefore, disconcerting to discover that 'testicular volume index' is followed (in sequence) by 'the clitoris', 'the diabetic foot' and, after diverting into 'the nephron' and elsewhere, 'testis maintenance'. Perhaps I have missed something here – or maybe a computer did the indexing?

Praeger Press: Born to crime: Cesare Lombroso and the origins of biological criminology, by Mary Gibson (2002, 272 pp, £37.50). Rev. by Anthony Walsh, Human Nature Review 3, 1 Jan. 2003. Apart from lacking the kind of pre- and post-Lombroso chapters I would have liked to have seen, I find only one fault in the book – its lack of a comprehensive index. Quite a number of individuals (e.g., Emile Durkheim, Gabriel Tarde) and concepts (e.g., biogenetic law, brain) mentioned in the text are not included in the index. Nevertheless, anyone wishing to be informed about the Italian school of criminology is not likely to receive a more thorough education from any other single source anytime soon.

Terra: Wokken met Ming (Wok Recipes with Ming), by Marc Deleonr (£29.95). Rev. in De Volkskrant, 14 June 2003. Register, onzinnig, op ingrediet, niet op gerecht: tientallen verwijzingen naar rijstwijn en zetmeel. (The index is nonsensical, ordered by ingredient by dish: dozens of entries for ricewine and cornstarch.)

Translation by Caroline Diepeveen, who submitted this item.

University of Alabama Press: United States–Latin American relations, 1850–1903: establishing a relationship, ed. by Thomas M. Leonard (1999, 303 pp, £44.95). Rev. by David M. Pletcher, American Historical Review 106(1), Feb. 2001. The index is inadequate as it is limited to proper names, with no subject headings, making economic relations especially difficult to trace.

University of California Press: Doing the town: the rise of urban tourism in the United States, 1850–1915, by Catherine Cocks (2001, xii + 287 pp, £37.50). Rev. by Jon Sterngass, American Historical Review 107(5), Dec. 2002. The index, however, is a disappointment; the entry for tourism contains sixty separate subheadings, and a check on hotels sends the reader to more than forty.

University of Hawaii Press: Defining Chu: image and reality in ancient China, ed. by Constance A. Cook and John S. Major (1999, ix + 254 pp, £59). Rev. by Rafe de Crespigny, American Historical Review 106(1), Feb. 2001. There are two weaknesses in an otherwise fine publication. First, there is no general map; there are regional ones, on eccentric scales, but nothing that gives a picture of Chu as a whole. Second, although there are characters in the bibliography, there are none in the index. As a result of these basic omissions, the book is harder to read than it should be, but it is nonetheless a substantial and indeed fascinating contribution to the study of early China.


This book is by no means perfect. There are mistakes in the indexing. Every scholar’s nightmare, that the reference numbers in the text should fail to match the appropriate passage in the ‘Notes’ section, has actually occurred in notes 15 to 34 of chapter six.

Yale University Press: The journals of Mary Butts, ed. by Nathalie Blondel (2002, £30). Rev. by Mark Bostridge, Independent on Sunday, 19 Jan. 2003. Blondel, who published a biography of Butts in 1998, has produced a well edited, but poorly indexed selection from Mary Butts’s journals, though it must be said that the fractured, fragmentary, almost diffuse quality of the writing will not attract many new adherents to Butts’s cause.

Indexes omitted


My only criticism of Levy is that the book has no index. I don’t understand why it doesn’t, given his grounding in the book arts. But then again, I guess I’m a paper guy living in a digital world.


Shortt is meticulous in his reflective, critical appreciations of the works. His ‘sketch’ has but 125 pages of text, useful notes, an index of names, but regrettably no topical index.


Overall, this book constitutes an important reference on the language, culture, and social worlds of Francophone communities established in the ten provinces of Canada. A great deal of research was invested in the preparation of eighteen tables and nine figures which accompany the text. This attractive presentation would, however, be more functional for reference purposes with a table or a figure index.


I struggled until I began to make my own cross-references, connecting a psalm with a season or festival. Oh for such an index!

Emerald: Continuity, culture, competition (proceedings of the 4th British Nordic Conference on Library and Information Studies, 2001), ed. by Linda Ashcroft (2002, 290 pp, £25). Rev. by K. G. B. Bakewell, New Library World 104(1184,1185), 2003. As with all conference papers, there is a variation in quality here, but there is a great deal of useful material which can have a considerable influence on library and information studies education in the twenty-first century. What a pity there is no index to enable it to be retrieved more easily!


Indexes reviewed
Indexes reviewed

This handsome, 1,372-page hardcover volume contains his complete essays (even his unfinished piece on Evelyn Waugh, which is missing from the four-volume edition) and selected reviews and journalism. It also includes an incisive introduction by the brilliant John Carey, but lacks an index—a grievous fault, but its only one.


My only complaint is that a book as laced with names and shames as this, a reissue originally published in 1994, really ought to have an index.


My one really serious criticism—and it’s a major one—is that McPhee’s book has no index. I found this utterly exasperating, since it is so rich in references that are not to be found in any other single source. Given that, and the heavy odds that *The Founding Fish* is bound to undergo more printings, it is not too late to add one.


The authors do not provide either a bibliography or an index. At £99.00 I would therefore question whether the Resource is a good value for money.


The book was rushed out and this first edition contains no index. Most seriously, it is already out of date.


. . . lazily, lacks an index.


It is pitiful that the publisher, who has allowed generous space for excellent appendices, has not given Ian Anstruther’s fascinating 80 pages an index.

**Historical Association of Ireland**: *Frank Ryan*, by Fearghal McGarry (89 pp, £9). Rev. by Brendan Ó Cathaoir, *Irish Times*, 18 Jan. 03.

This concise biography . . . is marred by the inexplicable absence of an index.


. . . the material is indifferently and confusingly organized: no index, no footnotes. More baffling for a book that purports to be about clothing, there are no pictures.


What a shame that the book has no index to allow readers to quickly locate the tips that are provided! A species index would have been a bit more icing on this scrumptious cake. Five blank pages are left at the end of the book for notes. They would easily have accommodated a species index—and still will: You learn by doing, and creating your own index will reinforce the aids that Sibley provides.


. . . an alphabetized encyclopedia seems intuitive enough, but one person’s intuition is often another person’s chaos. For example, though the book lacks entries for ‘galaxy mergers’ and ‘galaxy collisions’, the two are combined (pardon the pun) into ‘interacting galaxies’. You’ll also find reference to mergers under ‘canannibalism’, ‘CD galaxies’, and ‘starburst galaxies’, but who’d think of looking there? A simple index would solve this topical turmoil, allowing the reader to spend more time reading about a subject, not hunting for it.


E. S. de Beer’s edition of John Locke’s *Correspondence* was the crowning achievement of a life of scholarship. . . . Esmond de Beer himself had always hoped to complete his [eight] volumes with an index commensurate in scale and scope with the letters themselves. Failing eyesight made this impracticable, and the Clarendon Press editors have yet to complete his work. Without such an index, only those of preternatural patience or extensive prior scholarship could hope to find in the *Correspondence* what it particularly holds for them. Mark Goldie’s edition of *Selected Correspondence* is a timely attempt to unlock this cabinet of secrets for a much larger audience . . . Yet at the end of it all much of the cabinet of secrets remains obstinately closed. To unlock it fully, and fulfill de Beer’s quietly heroic ambition, still needs at the very least an index which does full justice to the unslected *Correspondence*.


. . . to go from a plate to a reference in the text is a frustrating business, as there are no page numbers given and there is no museum index.


Finally, an index would have helped us easily and quickly find and access information on the book’s many subtopics.


What he has written is not an encyclopaedia, at least not in the sense that *The Reader’s Digest* or *Diderot* would understand it, but a more anecdotal, eclectic assemblage of observations using fairy tales, cartoons, jokes, garden history and science fiction as source material. Unfortunately (some would say ‘stupidly’), he does not include an index, and the bibliography is a bit of a poor, thin thing.


One complaint: this paperback book has only 168 pages, no index and costs £20.


From ‘Aborigines’ to ‘Zoos’ in 450 pages this handy encyclopaedic work was inspired by a year’s stay in Sydney by the American author who is employed in the US Library of Congress. . . . The author’s easy and clear style of writing makes this a work to be dipped into for pleasure, as well as a useful though limited source of information on a wide variety of topics. However, although there are ‘see’ references within the text of articles, these are no substitute for a comprehensive index which (though adding greatly to the size of the book) would have increased access to the details. For example, the entry under ‘Mount Rennie Incident, 1886’ contains ‘see’ references to the entries for Sydney Hospital and larrikin pushes—but an index would have identified people and places . . . named in this particular entry.

**I. B. Taurus**: *The Dam Busters*, by John Ramsden (128 pp); *A Night to Remember: the definitive Titanic* film, by Jeffrey Richards
The Indexer
Vol. 23 No. 4 October 2003

A new selection of Susan Sontag essays – the first for 35 years –
Weidenfeld & Nicolson

...been more carefully edited.
I only wish this book had an index and that the reference list had
This is not a racy or sensationalist read. To the contrary, especially
This is not an edition for scholars. One must still refer to the
... the bibliography is organized chronologically by date of publication. The bibliographic index keyed to the numbered entries of the bibliography in the French edition has been omitted in the English edition, which makes the bibliography almost impossible to use. This is not an edition for scholars. One must still refer to the French edition for the references. ... The English edition is a sorry travesty of one of the best monographs on the Zanj revolt.

Bell acknowledges in the introduction her dislike of excessive annotation; it is perplexing in a book of this kind, however, to find no notes at all, and nothing by way of an index.

Obiter dicta

NB No entry for ‘Rain’ or ‘Midges’ in the index.

Spock’s index

The index [to Benjamin Spock’s Common sense book of baby and child care] briskly targeted areas of concern. You looked up ‘Crying’, and worked down the list of possible reasons, from hunger to an open nappy pin. And even if all strategies had failed, you were still told to have faith in yourself and not despair.

Penelope Lively, A House Unlocked (Grove Press, New York, 2001, p. 184)

The Indexer
Vol. 23 No. 4 October 2003