EXTRACTS FROM REVIEWS

... So far; an autobiography, by Meyer Weisgal (Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 404pp., £4). Rev., TLS, 12 May 72.

'The closeness of the Jewish family ... is underlined by the fact that no fewer than twenty-seven Weisgals (excluding the author) appear in the index.'


'A chronological list of Henty's works would have been more useful than the index, which does little more than name the titles as they appear in the bibliography.'


'There is an index, somewhat oddly arranged, since the majority of entries are listed under "mosquitoes" which leads to some anomalies and some odd entries, but as the index is brief, it can be easily scanned and is reasonably comprehensive in coverage.'


'It is regrettable that the index to this reprint is not more comprehensive, in view of the interest of the book.'


'But the value of this monograph suffers from the omission of three essentials—an index, a bibliography and a site-map.'


'A more mundane regret is that the reader's way has not been signposted a little more helpfully; despite a good index, sub-headings or section divisions would seem desirable in chapters which average forty to fifty pages each . . .'


'The editorial principles he follows in setting forth his texts are, in some ways, unexceptionable. To begin with, he numbers the letters "for convenience in identification"—though in what way it is a convenience to readers is unclear since in his cross-references and index he uses page numbers, and other scholars will always refer to a Young letter by recipient and date, never by number. The only convenience in numbering letters is that it enables the editor to perform his arithmetic in public. At least once he confuses himself because of these numbers; his index of correspondents puts a letter to Curll on page five when it is actually letter number five on page seven.'


'Considering the daunting nature of the task in its entirety, there are very few errors of any consequence, and the only economy seems to have been in the main index, where (for example) a reference to a discussion of the Dialogue between Apollo and Neptune by Sir Frederick Bridge (page 64) does not appear under the main entry on page 36.'


'Inevitably there is a price to be paid for this chronological arrangement: discussion of any one topic has come to be widely dispersed throughout the book. No reader could possibly guess that under the titles "Review of Hermann" and "Review of Havers" he would find two of the most instructive theoretical papers of the Anthology. This deficiency could have been remedied by an index; but none is provided. Over a limited area, some guidance is given by two editorial essays . . . These succeed admirably in reviewing and filling out the examples given of Bloomfield's work in . . . two special fields. But only a comprehensive index could have helped us with the book's other 400 pages.'


'A useful index and bibliography, absent of course from the French edition, are also added.'
‘... the notes do not dispense with the need for an index which the book unaccountably lacks.’

‘There is no index—a serious lack which could have been easily avoided by reproducing the Foulis edition of 1910, which has one.’

‘The result is something of an untidy patchwork. An index would have made the reader's task easier.’

‘There are few minor slips and blemishes... The unwary reader may be confused... by references in both the text and the index to the same Assyrian king as Sargon II and Sargon III.’

‘An encyclopaedia is usually a reference work, most frequently arranged alphabetically. In this case the arrangement is systematic and the book is more easily read than dipped into. The species headings are not obvious on the page, but there is a very thorough index of Latin and vernacular names and retrieval can be quite rapid. To retrieve information on a topic, however, is quite another matter. Reproduction, for example, has exactly two page-references in the index, the first refers to the fifteen-line description of mammalian reproduction in the introduction, and the second is an apparently chance mention picked up on the first page of the section of marsupials (on the basis of the key words vagina and penis, the first of which is not indexed at all and the second not mentioned for this page, nor indeed for anywhere in the book after page 50). Information is thus keyed only to species and genera. Short of reading the entire volume, comparisons are therefore limited to those chosen by the authors. In fact, although a huge amount of information has been assembled, the volume is seriously impaired by the poor organization of the material. It fails to meet the requirements of an encyclopaedia and becomes a large book.’

‘It has a good index—always a valuable attribute in a book of this kind.’

‘... Mr. Bentley has been very sparing with his annotations (and his index is a bad joke).’

‘Two suggestions: remove all diagrams and provide a more adequate index.’

Black’s picture information books: Seashore; Pond and marsh; Insects; Trees (£0.70 each). Rev., TLS, 14 Jul. 72.
‘... the index is reasonably adequate but there could be confusion between page numbers and picture numbers, notably in the seashore volume, where the survey of beach birds refers to picture numbers and the index reference is to the page number.’

‘It is all breathtaking; and, since this is not the kind of book which has an index, there is no clue by which one can locate anything one is looking for.’

The world of puppets, by Lothar Kampmann (Evans Brothers, 80pp., £1.50). Rev., TLS, 4 Aug. 72.
‘A contents page and index would make the book much easier to use.’

‘The book is unlikely to be superseded; it is scholarly and complete, although the index might perhaps be more detailed.’

‘How refreshing to turn to the index of a book on Edward VII to find but one reference to Lillie Langtry (misspelt “Lily”, but no matter) and none at all to either Lady Warwick or to Mrs. Keppel!’

The Indexer Vol. 8 No. 3 April 1973

"One would also have welcomed a proper analytical index instead of the bare index of terms which is in fact provided."

The Lordship of Ireland in the Middle Ages, by J. F. Lydon (Gill & Macmillan, 295pp., £3.50). Rev., TLS, 7 Jul. 72.

"... there is no justification at all, in a book of this sort, for the absence of an index."


"All told, however, this is a stimulating book with a first-class bibliography of Maurice's own writings, very full notes, but an index almost useless for working purposes."

Man and his gods, ed. by Prof. Geoffrey Parrinder and others (Hamlyn, 206pp., £5.95). Rev. by H. B. Boyne, Daily Telegraph, 27 Jan. 72.

"With many illustrations, most of them relevant, a history of religions is presented and with the help of an adequate index individual points of doctrine can be tracked down."


"The text is expanded by 37 pages which add enormously to the reference value of the book. Appendix I is a list of approximately 500 past and present abstracting services, arranged alphabetically by title, giving the dates of provision of abstracting service. The earliest reference dates back to 1950, but the majority are since 1962. These have been culled from world literature (mainly in English) in library science and other disciplines. The 8-page index is an adequate adjunct to the logical arrangement of the whole work."


"Advice to ancestor-worshippers: Always include a pedigree, an index, and a map. This helps to imprint them on the reader. Mr. Wilson has dispensed with all three."


"The dual convenience of synoptic and general indices (leading not to page numbers but to alphabetically arranged, inclusive articles) certainly gives the larger and broader work* an edge on Parrinder's book, with its scattered and somewhat inconsistent use of "see", "see also", "q.v.", and "q.q.v." references."

(*Comparison with A dictionary of comparative religion, ed. by Prof. S. G. F. Brandon, Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1970, £5.50.)


"The book is thoroughly documented and indexed, so much so that there are notes to non-existent parts in the text. The translations of the Mayakovsky poems are inaccurate. The illustrations are well-known and banal. What English readers with no Russian will find confusing are the four systems of transliteration for Russian names. Is this slipshod work, or the work of four different translators?"


"Mrs. Blakiston, tireless in her research, shrewd in her comments and excellent in her style, will earn the gratitude of everyone interested in social history; and so will her publisher, who has produced her book most carefully with a classified index."

The mythology of the secret societies, by J. M. Roberts (Secker and Warburg). Rev. by Philip Ziegler, Daily Telegraph, 12 Aug. 72.

"Let us hope that Mr. Roberts will address himself to this [the Luddite conspiracy of 1811] in a further study, and perhaps at the same time treat his readers to a less inadequate index."


"Not everything in the text has found its way into the index, which will make finding those interesting details irksome."

'However, the inter-disciplinary nature of many of them really calls for a subject index. Indeed, so many worthwhile contributions have been made to our various conferences that it would seem to be time for a cumulated index to LAA conference proceedings to make them as easily accessible as articles in this Journal.'


'At the end of each book there is an index but they vary in usefulness. The body has a thousand entries, Matter has an index only half this length, Light and vision's index has only about 300 entries, but it is the only volume to boast a short glossary of terms.'


'This report consists of replies to a detailed questionnaire on their author index practices, submitted by nineteen abstracting services for discussion at the 1971 annual meeting of the National Federation of Science Abstracting and Indexing Services. Each response is accompanied by sample indexes. The questionnaire covered layout, treatment of compound surnames, changed or variable surnames, given names, diacritical marks, filing, multiple authorship, authority lists, cumulation problems and other aspects. In diversity of practice in handling, this indexing "Cinderella" is apparent from the responses.

Although the compilers contribute a brief introductory discussion, the main value of the report is as a quarry of problems and examples of author indexing. This in itself is a useful contribution, for there is very little published of this neglected area.'


'Long before the end of this volume (which contains an invaluable index) Casanova has to admit by the age of 45 he has ceased to attract women . . .'


'Unhappily there is no index. A pity this for there is much valuable detail of the theatrical and film world just after the war.'


'Each volume has a detailed bibliography and each is well-indexed.'


'There is a good index and a long list of references, but some of the authorities quoted in the text do not appear in it.'


'This book, which will long remain a standard work, is fittingly produced, with plentiful illustrations, excellent maps and a clear, well-planned index.'


'Let us hope that Mr. Roberts will address himself to this in a further study, and perhaps at the same time treat his readers to a less inadequate index.'


'The book must long remain authoritative, and so I pity the scholars who will need to consult it: for this final volume, like its predecessors, has a wretched index, nor does it include any index at all to the complete work.'


'The volume is not indexed, but there is an adequate table of contents.'

'The editor is to be congratulated on the inclusion, in the book edition, of comprehensive author and subject indices.'


'The volumes are well-produced, and relatively free from typographical errors, while each has a very good index, which is essential in reference works of this type.'


'A minor general criticism is the length of the indexes; 59pp. of index for 486pp. of text is excessive, particularly when detailed contents lists precede each article. This would be a good place to start pruning the production costs of these volumes.'


'It is to be strongly regretted that the publishers have not seen fit to supply it with a satisfactory index. A passing reference (for instance) to "the culture of Pope, Swift and Johnson" as "essentially urban and metropolitan" is indexed under "Pope" and "Johnson" (but not "Swift"); whereas the paragraph devoted to the musical revolution of the 1760's associated with J. C. Bach is not indexed at all. It is very much to be hoped that this matter is mended in subsequent volumes of the series, the usefulness of which otherwise will be sadly impaired.'


'. . . Having been stimulated by this excellent publication, so finely printed and illustrated, . . . one eagerly awaits the promised second volume . . . One cannot forgive the omission of an index . . .'


'Some useful appendices and an adequate subject index are also included.'


'The authors are also overfond of referring to E. this and B. that without any clue as to the genus they have in mind. A quick excursion to the index (which is excellently complete and accurate) settles the matter, but that should not be necessary.'

Body time, by Gay Gaer Luce (M. T. Smith, £2.50). Rev. by Anthony Smith, New Scientist, 16 Nov. 72.

'. . . There are also fourteen pages of index.'

The government of science in Britain, by J. B. Poole and Kay Andrews (Weidenfeld & Nicolson, £5). Rev. by David Edge, New Scientist, 30 Nov. 72.

'I hope for . . . a cheap paperback edition and that its editors will by then have added an index.'

Elementary rheology, by G. W. Scott-Blair (Academic Press, London and New York, 1969, 158pp., £1.75). Rev. by Dr. N. S. Parker, Food Technology in Australia, Jan., 73.

'In a book which is intended as an introduction to a subject a comprehensive index is essential to enable the reader to find the meanings of unfamiliar terms. However, the subject index is short and many common terms are missing, for example: non-Newtonian, shear modulus, stress relaxation, and viscoelasticity.'


'There is no index and many places mentioned are not on the maps.'

"How surprising that there is no index! This is a valuable book, and readers will need to refer backwards and forwards for information—as I did myself—so lack of an index seems to me to be quite shocking."


"The index to the work, while accurate from the point of view of locating all items checked, was incomplete as far as coverage of contents was concerned. Among a number of omissions were any reference to the influence of Garamont's roman type (p. 27), Garamond type mentioned on page 23 and Garamont in relation to the influence of his type on Alexander Wilson's Greek type (p. 31)."

The above extracts from reviews have been mostly contributed by Mr. Bruce S. C. Harling; others have been received from Mrs. V. C. Findlay, Mr. H. Godfrey Green, Mr. G. Norman Knight, Dr. H. A. Whatley, Miss K. J. Sinclair, Mr. John M. Shaftesley and the Hon. Editor.

Extracts from American Reviews


"... so many names come up, in fact, that the absence of an index is unfortunate."


"From this collection of essays, the reader may try to construct his own synthesis. An index would facilitate the task. The omission of this standard tool of scholarship ... suggests hasty editing."


"And the indexes—the last volume will hold an overall summary and unified index to all the work—are means to turn this ample warehouse of ideas into a workable tool-bench. They are signed rightfully and proudly by Muriel Moyle."


"There are three indexes, no less, and a unique appendix updates the history, activities, key personnel and assembly data of the world's manufacturers, including the lesser known and hard to find."

Sketches of a tour to the lakes, of the character and customs of the Chippeway Indians, and of incidents connected with the Treaty of Fond du Lac, by Thomas L. McKenney (Imprint Society, $40). Rev. by William C. Sturtevant, Smithsonian 3, 8 Nov. 72.

"... there are no notes to the text, no map of the journey, nor even an index to the contents."


"While this work is basic for one who needs data beyond the level of that in Frank G. Menke's Encyclopedia of sports, the inadequacy of the index negates the book's usefulness. The index omits players' names and items from the text, and the book cannot be recommended until the index is revised."


"... one regrets that the over selective index lessens the book's reference value."

The Indexer Vol. 8 No. 3 April 1973

'As a set of general readings in a field that has no defined boundaries, this book will be useful for general collections. Its reference value is limited, however, since there is no index and no bibliography.'


'The value of the book is enhanced by a good bibliography and index.'


'The volume could be a valuable reference book except for one serious weakness: lack of a thorough index. There is a complete table of contents, and the glossary does include page references; but these do not replace an index.'


'Besides its fourteen papers the book contains . . . satisfyingly complete author and subject indexes.'


'Also, the extensive bibliography (over 1,000 entries) includes the numbers of the pages on which the references are cited, in a sense combining the functions of bibliographies and author indexes into one unit.'


'The index is poor and sketchy, but the extensive bibliography is valuable.'


'There are two indexes of the subjects, by detailed list of topics and by department, including congressional committees, appointed boards and commissions, international bodies, etc.'


'The subject index is comprehensive, but a book of this size and scope should certainly have included an author index.'


'The only fault in this humane and informative book is its lack of an index.'

Leaders in profile, the United States Senate: 1972 edition, the Ninety-second Congress, by George Douth (Sperr & Douth, $2.95).

'... the index is excellent and will be useful to those seeking data on individuals who introduce legislation in particular fields.'


'The book does have the rules of golf complete, a carelessly compiled index, and some explication of English golf language.'


'The index also was expanded from thirty-one pages in the second edition to forty-one in the third. Compiled as a reference guide, it contains many brief entries to the names of individuals, societies, institutions, titles, and subjects. Footnotes and the bibliography are indexed, and occasionally the location of certain items in libraries or other institutions is shown by the abbreviation loc.'

'There's even an index by city—a veritable "Directory of Occult Specialists".'

Ernest Hemingway and the arts, by Emily Stipes Watts (Univ. of Illinois Press, $7.95; paper $3.95). Rev. by Jean Spang, Lib. Jl., 15 Mar. 72.

'The many illustrations of paintings owned and/or used by Hemingway and the index of references to art both in his works and in studies of him also help to make this a valuable addition to any collection of Hemingway criticism.'


'... Volume 5 will prove most useful. It is above all a good index to the preceding volumes. It contains a name index and a subject index; both seem to be complete, and both are indispensable for anyone seeking to make serious use of the Gravel edition.'


'The descriptive information for each entry isn't consistently inclusive (e.g. some Oscars are mentioned, others aren't) and the absence of cross-references or an index is rather sad.'


'This well-written book is directed at the interested nonspecialist. A much more complete index would assist a paleontologist in finding the place where his favourite group is discussed (for example, brachiopods and conodonts are discussed in the text but not listed in the index).'


'This book indexes 243 Festschriften (in 259 volumes) of studies in Jewish history and literature of all periods and places. The list of Festschriften indexed is followed by an author index of some 6,700 articles and a subject index with some 1,600 headings. While most of the material indexed will be of interest primarily to specialists in Jewish studies, there are a great many names and topics pertinent to the biblical field as well. This is a welcome and useful guide to materials not easily discovered.'


'Forsman has produced a very good index of recipes in magazines for 1970. It would be excellent except for two things: the introduction to the work is so brief that I didn't really understand Forsman's explanation of how to use the index; and I feel that the Sunday New York Times magazine should also be indexed, as many cooks throughout the country buy the Sunday Times just for the weekly recipe. Also, if Woman's Day is indexed, why not Family Circle? The indexing is very thorough, however; even a recipe in an advertisement is listed. The index is in alphabetical order with headings by ingredients, nationality, type of dish, and name of the recipe. A recipe with a French name is listed alphabetically by that name, but it can also be found under its major ingredient. Recipes are also listed by method of preparation, and special diets have their own headings. The index covers the year 1970, and according to the publisher, 1971 and 1972 are in the works.'


'The weakest part of the publication is its index. The author states that the index is only supplementary, but we cannot agree with him, since we feel that the index must be an essential part of this kind of bibliography. We suspect that the index was edited in a hurry—it is filled with bothersome mistakes. There are entries without numbers, titles listed in the book and not listed in the index (e.g. Census of population), and titles listed in the index but not appearing in the text (e.g. PAIS).'

'This book is full of interesting facts and ideas and can be recommended both as good reading and as a valuable reference source. A useful feature is the inclusion at the end of the volume of an additional index each for all plant species, animal species, and authors cited in the text.'


'Unfortunately the book suffers from careless typos and an inadequate index. The index does reference names and illustrations (in bold type), but does not indicate model name or year of manufacture. This is extremely annoying when one is trying to locate a specific account or illustration (e.g. for Fiat there are eighty separate, nonspecific references to either pages or illustrations).'


'Readers of all ages will be enthralled by this work, and scholars will welcome the first-person material and the thorough index, the discography of "52nd St. Music", and the liberal sprinkling of photographs.'


'This book, with its careful and extensive indexing, is usable . . .'


'The extensive bibliographies include translated titles in all references to the Russian literature, and should be a valuable aid to further literature search and to further translation projects. There are thorough subject and author indexes. The translator has made this a highly readable and useful volume.'


'It is very unfortunate that references are omitted entirely except for "general references" following each chapter. Sometimes (as in "Organic mercury compounds") these are all Russian references, of small use to English readers. Happily the subject index is extensive (31 pages) and reliable. The translation is immaculate.'


'The index often has scores of entries to keyed words—a headache.'

All the above extracts have been submitted by Herman Baron, Philip Deemer, Simon Newman, Eleanor Steiner-Prag, Miriam Steinert.

ROMANIZATION OF JAPANESE

Consideration of ways in which the letters of the roman alphabet can be made to represent the characters of languages which use quite different written forms is being undertaken by a British Standards Institution committee. The work of this committee has resulted in standards for the transliteration of Cyrillic and Greek (BS 2979) and of Arabic (BS 4280), and the latest publication to emerge is BS 4812, Romanization of Japanese. This standard does not contain a new method for the romanization of Japanese; it confirms that the long-established Hepburn system is still the one best suited for use in the English-speaking world. By means of notes and tables it gives full details of the form generally known as 'modified Hepburn'. Some useful information concerning other systems is also provided, together with a list of variants.

Copies are available price 70p from BSI Sales Branch, 101 Pentonville Road, London, N1 9ND.